The first surge of feeling by the congregation aimed towards a rebuilding of the church, but as the congregation discussed the prospect it became painfully apparent that the funds for elaborate rebuilding would be difficult for the congregation that had then dwindled down to only 170 to raise. The church had originally been built in good portion by an exceedingly generous gift from a wealthy benefactor and this type of help was no longer forthcoming. The congregation also decided against rebuilding even modestly on the same site because of the noise of the Pennsylvania Railroad nearby. In those days of steam locomotives and heavy passenger traffic it probably was an annoyance to the pastor especially in summer with the windows open. Today with the electrification of the railroad and a drastic drop in railroad traffic, noise is less of a factor. The Methodist church then was looking for another location.

At the same time the legal battles of the Hungarian Presbyterians were settled and an exchange was agreed upon for offering to the Methodist church, the smaller building on Hamilton and Easton Avenue for the larger possibilities of the burned-out church on Bayard and Schuyler (changed much later from Schuyler to Joyce Kilmer Ave). This area was also felt to be advantageously near the French Street Hungarian stronghold.

It has not been possible to get first hand records of the rebuilding of the church but the Orlick family and other members of the congregation have been very helpful in presenting a partial picture of the old sanctury as they remember it some years later. In the time of Rev. Charles Papp the outside of the building must have looked much the same as it had when it was originally rebuilt, except for the steeple which had been considerably shortened and covered with slate. Inside the building, a single great chandelier was suspended from the high ceiling. The chancel or altar area was raised three steps above the congregation as it is today, and held a lectern for the reading of the scriptures with two high-backed chairs on either side of the pulpit. When the minister was ready to begin his sermon he walked to the extreme back of the chancel (where the drapes are now), ascended four steps to the very ornate dark mahogany pulpit that protruded from the wall, and was capped by a pointed cupola. From here he commanded a view of all his congregation who were forced to gaze upward as they listened to his sermon. Music for the service was provided by the organ while the choir sang. With the minister in his lofty perch the congregation had good reason to look even higher to the ceiling painting of so many years before of the "ceiling representing Heaven's blue, studded with the constellations of stars..." Parts of the original painting still exist in its flaky and darkened condition high above the false ceiling that was installed in the 1940's in order to conserve on heat in the building.